

SUSTAINABLE WINE CERTIFICATION BENCHMARK STUDY

Version: Results report

Issued: April 2022





Table of Contents

Foreword	3
Scope	3
Limitations	5
Methodology	5
Criteria	7
Results	11



Foreword

Certifications for sustainable wine are an important source of information for assessing, securing and improving the environmental and social conditions in the industry. Intertek partnered with wine retailers to benchmark regional, national and international certification, audit standards and their assessment methodologies. Purpose of the benchmark was to evaluate the schemes for their scope and robustness in regard to scheme management, sustainable winegrowing and production. To do so, the standards were benchmarked from three perspectives:

- Governance and Quality Oversight of the scheme
- Environment (divided into Environmental-Cultivation and Environmental-Production)
- Labor Conditions

There are several contexts where this information can be an important tool to secure a sustainable assortment of wine, including:

- Risk mapping of products
- Design of tender requests
- Customer guidance

Scope

The project for 2022 consisted in two segments:

PART I: Update the existing benchmark to reflect any changes to the standards since last review. And, if no current changes, collect information as to when each scheme is next scheduled to be updated for their internal reference.

PART II: Expand the benchmark to the schemes pending from other rounds and some additional ones.

The general approach of this study was to benchmark the selected schemes' audit requirements based on a self-assessment questionnaire (SAQ) that included specific questions related to the categories Governance and Quality Oversight of the scheme, Environmental-Cultivation, Environmental-Production and Labor Conditions.

It was decided to make a distinction between Environmental-Cultivation and Environmental-Production requirements as the indicators vary significantly between the business activities. The Labor Conditions indicators are not separated for Cultivation and Production as it was found that schemes address Labor items in a more uniform way and less specific to the production stage.

The SAQ results and provided evidence were analyzed during a desktop assessment after which the results were categorized as Basic, Good and Advanced requirements. Schemes were given the opportunity to



provide insight in so called unique requirements. These unique requirements are communicated in the rough data but are not rated or benchmarked in the Final Results Table.

Limitations

There shall be considered that only selected topics for the categories Environmental-Cultivation, Environmental-Production, Labor Conditions and Governance & Quality Oversight were benchmarked whereas schemes may cover a wider range of topics that were outside of the project scope.

For the updated schemes, consider that only the updates regarding the requested criteria Environmental-Cultivation, Environmental-Production, Labor Conditions and Governance & Quality Oversight were analyzed whereas schemes may have updated a wider range of topics that were outside the project scope.

For schemes with different requirement levels, the most advanced requirement of the scheme is included in this benchmark study. Furthermore, schemes may require adherence to local law without further guidance, it could be that this law is equal or more comprehensive than requirements set by other schemes. Review of applicable laws was outside of the project scope. Also, the varying level of information and documented evidence provided resulted in different levels of verifiable information.

Schemes specially designed for the wine industry (cultivation and production) were better suited to the categorization.

For the schemes in which a desk evaluation was carried out to collect the information, the best effort was made, although on some occasions not all the necessary information was found, and the point was considered as “not addressed”.



Methodology

Benchmarks were developed for each sub-category and resulted in an overall category result. Due to the request of some scheme owners to not publicize the specific scheme requirements, this report only includes the colored grading per sub-category and an overall category scoring overview.


The scoring definitions for each sub-category are included in Annex 3 Criteria. The schemes' results per sub-category are included in Annex 1 Specified Results. The definition of the three categories is as follows:

Basic (light green) = Basic requirements are met

Good (middle green) = Basic + Good requirements are met to a satisfactory level

Advanced (dark green) = Basic + Good + Advanced are met to a satisfactory level

Results from the tab Specified Results were translated in a numerical score:

Not addressed (white):	0 points	
Basic (light green):	1 point	
Good (middle green):	2 points	
Advanced (dark green):	3 points	

The sub-category scores were translated into numerical values and were divided by the number of sub-categories which resulted in an overall category score, displayed in Annex 2 Summary.

The scores for Summary results were rounded as follows:

Basic (light green): $\geq 0.1 - \leq 1.5$

Good (middle green): $\geq 1.5 - \leq 2.5$

Advanced (dark green): ≥ 2.5

Example:



The above results from the Specified Results were translated to numerical values: $3 + 2 + 2 + 3 + 0 = 10$

The overall score (10) for this category was divided by the number of sub-categories (5): $10 : 5 = 2$

The summary result was 2 points/middle green.



Criteria

Category Governance:

	Basic (light green)	Good (middle green)	Advanced (dark green)
Auditor requirements	Defined educational background, years of auditing/industry experience	Scheme specific training program	International standard such as ISO, SA8000 or APSCA
Quality oversight of 3rd party auditing body	No basic requirement option	3 rd party is monitored by the scheme owner	Accreditation by (International) recognized standard such as ISO/IEC17021 or other external oversight committee
Scheme standard/manual revision and stakeholder engagement	No set timeline for standard revision; Involves direct stakeholders farms, wineries, auditing bodies during annual meeting	Timeline for review but not documented; Involves a wider group of stakeholders (such as academics) during regular meetings and correspondence	Documented timeline for standard review; Public consultations involves stakeholders in- and outside of the wine industry and academics (eg proposed revisions are accessible on website for feedback)
Board members	Positions are described	Specified timeline for re-application	Duties and restrictions are documented
Report validation process	No basic requirement option	Scheme owner	3 rd party auditing body

Category Social Aspects:

	Basic (light green)	Good (middle green)	Advanced (dark green)
Rights of freedom of Association	Local law applies; topic is addressed in statement; open dialogue between management & workers	Formal declaration(e.g. a policy on freedom of association) of the company that workers can form or join unions of their choosing. Statements that workers cannot be penalized or intimidated because of their membership to a union	Union representatives can visit work location; workers are free to choose leaders
No discrimination	Local law applies; topic is addressed in statement	Documented rules/guidelines/company policies or code of ethics in order to avoid discrimination when hiring, training, promoting, dismissing and retiring staff; Identify vulnerable groups	Employee training/communication; Instrument in place where employees can report discrimination. Assigned staff to handle reported cases; wage or promotion system in place that ensures equal opportunities



Fair remuneration	Local law applies legal minimum wage; Including the legal rate for overtime, annual leave is paid in accordance with legislation as well as other benefits.	Payment records available; workers receive pay slips (incl hours and deductions); regular payments to workers	List the conditions for wage deduction for food, housing, PPE. Living wage; Include agency hired workers; Wage for piece rate workers. Benefit package. Salary survey.
Decent working hours	Local law applies; Legal working hours, including overtime	Documentation such as policies, procedures, working hour records; overtime is voluntary; maximum number of overtime	Flexible working hours to promote reconciliation of family and work; addressing working hours for vulnerable groups such as lactating women, young mothers, temporary/migrant/young workers; workers are offered a meal/transportation when making overtime
Occupational Health and Safety	Local law applies	Policies and procedures; training & records; PPE provided free of costs, assigned H&S staff; H&S training and communication	Training frequency; incident records; identified hospitals/clinics; accident/illness prevention plan; risk management; excluding vulnerable groups from certain tasks
No child labor	Local law applies	Documentation such as policies, procedures, records (eg. age verification)	Specify certain occasions where children may carry out (very light and non-hazardous) work for family farms only; consultation of external party; remediation efforts; school attendance
Special protection for young workers	Local law applies	Documentation such as policies, procedures, record (e.g. age verification)	Addresses the maximum number of hours for work including transportation; working conditions; remediation efforts; consultation of external party
No precarious employment	Local law applies	Documentation such as policies and procedures; all employees have contracts or are orally informed about job position, wage, benefits if any, working times, leave entitlement, housing; monetary salary	Labor planning; Seek to employ the same seasonal workers every year; contracts in the desired language of the employee; max % may be hired through labor contractors; after X number of years seasonal/permanent workers receive same benefits as directly employed workers; if applicable, Contract between producer and recruitment agent setting out obligations



No bonded labor	Local law applies	Policies and procedures; records; specify the characteristics of forced labor (involuntary employment, debt bondage, retention of ID, not free to leave the workplace at the end of the shift, not free to leave employment)	Contract between producer and recruitment agent setting out obligations; workers living on site are free to leave the workplace at the end of their shift
Ethical business behavior	Local law applies	Policies and procedures	Risk management of business partners; screening business partners; fair prices; no misleading information

Category Environmental Cultivation (Vineyard):

	Basic (light Green)	Good (Middle green)	Advanced (Dark green)
Long term soil health (improving/increasing the organic content, minimizing tillage and soil compaction, preventing soil erosion, minimizing application of chemical fertilizers and pesticides)	Topic is addressed	Plan in place to maintain and improve the long-term soil conditions (soil health); Soil health methods are planned and documented; Policies and practices; Records contain methods; training of staff; assigned personnel	(Frequency of) Soil, testing; organic content, Ph if possible, soil biota, testing by a lab/third party; Measures to minimize soil compaction, tillage and soil erosion. Regenerative agriculture.
Crop/pest management	Topic is addressed	Pest-management/ insect and mite pest management plan; monitoring and record keeping; control measures; responsible personnel; training	Specific guidance from the scheme taking different pests and diseases in consideration (such as a prohibited/restriction list of chemicals); pesticide resistance avoidance strategies, and a plan review and update schedule
Use of fertilizers	Topic is addressed	Fertilization plan in place; monitoring techniques and record keeping of application; control measures; responsible personnel; training; Frequency and quantity of application	(Frequency of) Soil and leaves nutrition testing values N, P, K, PH; Limitations to the use of nitrogen and synthetic fertilizers



Biodiversity	Topic is addressed	Ecosystem Management plan in place; Focused on protecting ecosystem and wildlife habitat and minimize direct negative impact	Enhance ecosystem and wildlife habitat; red list of endangered or threatened species; repairing damages caused; assigned personnel; consultation of external party
Energy Use and climate impact	Energy Management Plan and the legally required permits	Policies and practices; Energy (fuel and electricity) use is recorded	Improve energy efficiency; fuel saving practices; reduce consumption of electrical energy; Strategy on renewable energy; assigned person; machinery/vehicle use. Carbon neutral/ Carbon negative targeted years.
Resources and Waste management	Topic is addressed; legally required permits	Documentations such as waste management plan, policy and procedures; assigned personnel; training; assign waste handling bodies	Risk assessment; storage for hazardous waste; reduce the amount of waste, Mechanical Operation Efficiency (such as combining several tasks or treating more than one row at a time), recycling and reusing material
Water Use and treatment	Water management plan and the legally required permits	Policy and procedure; Irrigation records	Management plan includes monitoring soil water holding capacity, water intake rate, and water permeability; monitoring of irrigation system; water budget (amount of water that can be used); monitoring offsite movement; local water conditions; rainwater/river water use; reduce water use



Category Environmental Production (Winery):

	Basic (light green)	Good (normal green)	Advanced (dark green)
Energy use and climate impact	Energy Management Plan and the legally required permits	Policies and practices; Energy use is recorded	Improve energy efficiency; fuel saving practices; reduce consumption of electrical energy; Strategy on renewable energy;
Water use and treatment	Water management plan and the legally required permits	Policies and procedure; (waste) water is monitored	If not required by law: third party monitoring wastewater treatment and content; recycling water; third party consultation
Use of resources and waste handling	Waste management plan and the legally required permits	Policies and procedures; sorting waste; assign waste handling bodies	Risk assessment; storage for hazardous waste; reduce the amount of waste, recycling and reusing material
Emissions (air, water, land)	Local law applies	Policies and procedures; employee training	Risk assessment, measures taken to avoid/reduce emissions. Reduction of chemical products.
Packaging material	Topic is addressed	thickness of glass is defined, maximize the use of recycled or easily biodegradable packaging	Certified material, the use of certain material is forbidden

